Patriarchy and the Informal Economy: The Case for Women Empowerment.

Seven case studies from the Social Protection and Local Economic Development (LED): Graduation Pilot project

May 2015

Social Protection and Local Economic Development (LED): Graduation Pilot Project

Working Paper 10

By Brian Mathebula and Matshidiso Motsoeneng
Contents
Preface and acknowledgements.................................................................................................................3
Executive Summary........................................................................................................................................4
1. Introduction and background to the study.................................................................................................6
   1.1. Purpose and Scope ..............................................................................................................................7
2. Literature review........................................................................................................................................8
   2.1 The informal economy and women .....................................................................................................8
   1.2. Patriarchy and gender roles................................................................................................................12
3. Case studies.............................................................................................................................................16
4. Analysis of case studies.............................................................................................................................25
5. Conclusion and recommendations............................................................................................................29
6. Bibliography............................................................................................................................................31

Tables and Figures

Table 1: Defining the informal economy.......................................................................................................8
Table 2: Defining Patriarchy..........................................................................................................................12
Figure 1: Unemployment rate by sex, Quarter 1: 2008 to Quarter 3:2014.....................................................10
Figure 2: Year on Year change in the informal sector unemployment, Quarter 1: 2009 to Quarter 3: 2014...........................................................................................................................................11
Preface and acknowledgement

The SPII researchers working on the *Social Protection and Local Economic Development Graduation Pilot Project* would like to specifically thank the Ford Foundation and Christian Aid for making this study possible. In addition, the researchers would like to extend a special word of thanks to the project participants who welcomed us into their households, lives and shared their experiences as part of these case studies.

This paper was written by Matshidiso Motsoeneng and Brian Mathebula. The interviews were conducted by Matshidiso Motsoeneng, Lebohang Moloi, Kgomotso Limba and Tokoloho Chabalala.

Project made possible with funding from the

![Ford Foundation](image1)

![Christian Aid](image2)
Executive overview

Patriarchy is a system that legitimises the social, political and economic male dominance in a society. In the last three decades, the developing world has experienced significant growth in the number of jobs created in the informal economy, and it has provided a primary source of income for many women in the developing world. Economic income-generating activities in the informal economy are by law or in practice not covered or insufficiently covered by formal arrangements. This study provides an analysis of the extent of patriarchy among project participants in the Social Protection and Local Economic Development (LED): Graduation Pilot Project undertaken by the Studies in Poverty and Inequality Institute (SPII) in Evaton Township, South Africa. Through a multi-case study approach, the researchers analysed the experiences of seven women who form part of the pilot project. Each case was examined within the setting and across settings to provide an understanding of how patriarchy manifests itself, and to provide an understanding of the similarities and differences between each manifestation of patriarchy as defined in the literature reviewed. The study found that within cases reviewed patriarchal norms exist, and what we also found was that the patriarchal norms were accepted and expected as part of the social construct.

Recommendations:

- The gender development dialogue has not taken policy and practical solutions for women empowerment beyond discussion. It is time that a policy is designed to empower women in practical ways to have greater autonomy over their financial and economic endeavours.
- Programmes such as this pilot, who tend to have greater participation by women, should encourage and cater for the involvement of project participants’ partners/husbands and fathers to deal with the notion of patriarchy as part of the transformation agenda.
- Better access to affordable and developmental childcare facilities is essential.
- Better access to affordable micro-credit for women could create resilient livelihoods for women in the informal economy.
- Easier entry to markets and opportunities for livelihood diversification for women is one way of forging pathways for women to compete in the economy, together with deliberate attempts to include women in small-scale manufacturing. The reason is that more women are involved in trade while fewer women are found in the manufacturing sector which generally is more lucrative and capable of building up larger enterprises and creating more jobs.
• Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises (SMME) and LED strategies that aim to develop township economies need to be cognisant of the role of gender and patriarchy within society, and that there is a need for greater coordination of programmes geared at empowering women.

• Partnerships with Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) and other Community Based Organisations (CBOs) that deal with the empowerment of women are imperative for policy development in order to address gender disparities and, ultimately, for dismantling patriarchy.

• Education and training programmes on technical skills should have a component that focuses on gender role transformation and education in order to prevent the perpetuation of patriarchal oppression and gender discrimination.
1. Introduction and background to the study

_The business of womanhood is a heavy burden..... How could it not be? And these days it is worse
with the poverty of blackness on one side and the weight of womanhood on the other._ (Tsitsi
Dangarembga)¹

Although the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa Act 108 of 1996 provides for equality for
all, significant strides still need to be made for the attainment of equality socially, politically and
economically. One of the key issues that the country still grapples with in a globalised and
interconnected world is how to merge known and ‘accepted’ societal norms and the rights
enshrined in the Constitution. This paper explores and discusses the extent to which women and
their development are socially, economically and politically hampered by patriarchal norms that
remain prevalent in social relations. Through seven case studies from the _Social Protection and Local
Economic Development (LED): Graduation Pilot Project_² in Evaton Township, Gauteng, South Africa,
SPII brings to the fore the experiences of seven women and how patriarchy manifests itself in their
lives. Through their experiences, we seek to obtain a deeper understanding of how patriarchy
manifests itself and how these women deal with it. In order to achieve this, the experiences of the
participants, as reflected on and shared by project fieldworkers/enterprise coaches are brought to
light.

In order to achieve this, the paper highlights the socioeconomic questions that are important in
understanding some of the challenges experienced by these women in the pilot project. It links
these findings to a greater debate around patriarchy in an African, modern capitalist society. The
paper will begin with a discussion on the informal economy in South Africa and other developing

¹ Tsitsi Dangarembga is a Zimbabwean literary author. Her novel _Nervous Conditions_, published in 1998,
provides an account of struggles of women in African societies.

² The Social Protection and Local Economic Development (LED): Graduation Pilot Project is a 24-month pilot
project in Evaton Township. The pilot project is building on the successes of the graduation model adopted by
the Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committees (BRAC). The SPII graduation model is adapted for the South
African context, and within the project we have 150 project participants who live in households that have a
recipient of the state provided Child Support Grant (CSG) and who are currently running a micro and
survivalist enterprise in the informal economy. To read more about the project background, please visit
countries. This will be followed by a literature review on the informal economy and women’s roles therein, followed by a discussion on patriarchy and gender roles. Seven experiences of women, in the form of multiple case studies are shared and juxtaposed against the literature reviewed. To conclude, recommendations are provided in an effort to try to challenge the status quo and more importantly, to facilitate dialogue that will eventually lift the burden of poverty and inequality.

1.1. **Purpose and Scope**

SPII is currently undertaking the 24-month *Social protection and local economic development (LED): Graduation Pilot Project*, which aims to develop a strong connection between social assistance and local economic development (LED) in Evaton Township, South Africa.³ One of the key themes that has emerged throughout the project, as reflected by fieldworkers/enterprise coaches is the role of patriarchy among project participants. The purpose of this study is to provide an understanding of how patriarchy manifests itself within the selected case studies. As a result, this paper highlights the experiences of seven individual robust case studies which examine the extent and influence of patriarchy among the project participants (Yin, 2003; Stake, 2005)⁴ and how they deal with it on a daily basis. Through a multiple case study approach, the researchers explore the differences within and between cases.

---

³ The pilot project also demonstrates the theoretical assumptions of the adaptation of the BRAC graduation pilot project. The pilot is leveraging on the success of South Africa’s social assistance programme and the adaptation of the BRAC graduation model by SPII is built on the back of this social assistance programme.

⁴ They suggest that in a case study approach it is important to narrow the focus of the research by placing boundaries by time and place, activity and definition, and context.
2. Literature review

2.1 The informal economy and women

In the last three decades, developing countries have experienced exponential growth in terms of employment in the informal sector. This has mainly been attributed to the decline or stagnation in the number of jobs created by the formal sector.\(^5\)

Table 1: Defining the informal economy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SOURCE</th>
<th>DEFINITION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Valodia and Davy (2012)</td>
<td>(a) Non-registration of the enterprise in terms of national legislation, such as taxation and/or other commercial legislation; (b) non-registration of employees of the enterprise in terms of labour legislation; and (c) small size of the enterprise in terms of the people involved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southern Africa Trade Union Coordination Council (SATUCC) (2011)</td>
<td>Characterized by ‘easy entry and exit and are driven by self-employment activities’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Labour Organisation (2002)</td>
<td>‘All activities by workers and economic units that are in law or in practice not covered or insufficiently covered by formal arrangements’.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nadin and Williams (2010:363)</td>
<td>‘Off the books’, ‘undeclared’, ‘shadow’, ‘cash in hand’, and ‘hidden economy. Nadin and Williams (2010) define an informal entrepreneur as someone engaged in starting a business or who has been the owner of a business for less than forty-two months, who participates in the production and sale of goods and services that are legitimate in all respects besides the fact that they are unregistered by or hidden from the state for tax purposes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO (2002) in Skinner (2004)</td>
<td>The informal sector is regarded as a group of household enterprises or unincorporated enterprises owned by households that include informal own-account enterprises, which may employ contributing family workers and employees on an occasional basis; and enterprises of informal employers, who employ one or more employees on a continuous basis.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chen (2007:5)</td>
<td>The informal economy ‘is made up of non-standard wage workers as well as entrepreneurs and self-employed persons producing legal goods and services, albeit through irregular or unregulated means’.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Own tabulation

---

\(^5\) Ramani et al. (2013).
Since its acclaimed ‘discovery’ in the 1970s, the informal economy has provided a primary source for income generation for many women in the developing world. This can be in the form of self-employment (selling directly to consumer), contract labour (regularly producing for another organisation), casual labour (working on and off for other organisations) or contributing family members. Street trading and home-based producers dominate this sector (ibid). In fact, in India over 94% of total employment is accrued in the informal sector, while in Mexico, the informal sector accounts for 62% of total employment and in South Africa is totalled at 34% (Chen, 2005: Ramani et al., 2013).

Makama (2013:120) argues that the ‘role of women in employment and economic activities is often underestimated because most of women work in the informal sectors, with low productivity and incomes, poor working conditions, with little or no social protection’. This assertion was collaborated by work by the ILO (2013)\(^6\) which concluded that housewives, single mothers, widowers, pensioners and unemployed youth dominate the informal economy, as it presents both financial freedom and livelihood strategies.\(^7\) An earlier study by the United Nations (2009) argued that there is a need to address gender inequalities with regard to access to economic and financial resources in the light of development in societies. It further expressed that ‘gender equality in the distribution of economic and financial resources has positive multiplier effects for a range of key developmental goals, including poverty reduction and the welfare of children.

---

\(^6\) The ILO also holds that in Sub-Saharan Africa, in contrast with other regions, the percentage of women employed in the informal sector is generally higher than that of men.


\(^7\) According to the 2009 World Survey on the Role of Women in Development, financial independence is also critical in enabling women to be able to leave bad relationships and rely on themselves financially.
Entrance into the informal economy for women is often influenced by other women. Valodia (2000:5) writes that ‘in the informal economy, women occupy the low-income low skills occupations’. These are mainly in retail, which involves hawking (street-trading), spaza shops\textsuperscript{8}, dress-making businesses and shebeens\textsuperscript{9}. Other sectors include community and social services such as Early Childhood Development (ECD) Centres, with around 28.7% of women employed in the community and social services sector (Atmore, 2012), while the rest are immersed in the hair industry, either employed by, or running their own hair salons.\textsuperscript{10}

\textsuperscript{8} A spaza shop is a micro-convenience store which operates in township residential areas, selling groceries, bread, cool drinks, sweets and cigarettes.

\textsuperscript{9} A township bar or club, usually operated from a home backyard.

\textsuperscript{10} It is reported that the South African ethnic hair-care industry is worth a staggering R9.7 billion a year. http://www.supermarket.co.za/SR_Downloads/S&R%20Aug%202011%20Personal%20care.pdf
In South Africa, there were around 2.1 million people who were actively involved in the informal economy in quarter one of the 2009 of labour survey (StatsSA, 2013). The South African Local Government Association (SALGA) (2012) reported that in the absence of informal economy activities, the unemployment rate (broad definition), and unemployment rate would rise to 47, 5%, or just under half of the labour market. It is important to also note that there are those who are in this economy on a part-time basis as they hold formal-sector jobs and use these micro-enterprises in the informal economy as a means to supplement inadequate income from their formal-sector employment.

The South African informal economy is characterised by small-scale enterprises that provide self-employment for families and households (Rolfe, et al., 2010). Chingono (2012:7) states that ‘both poverty and the informal economy are inevitable consequences of the failure of dominant development discourses articulated by the IMF and the World Bank implemented by third world governments’. All too frequently, it is ignored as a sector because it absorbs those that cannot find jobs in the formal sector; in other words, its role is seen as mopping up formal unemployment, rather than being appreciated as a dynamic economy in itself. There is also a need to take into account that in the informal economy there are enterprises that are classified as family enterprises (which consist of independent owners and family members) and those that consist of two or more employees (although they might not be formally registered as enterprises).
1.2. Patriarchy and gender roles

The concept of ‘patriarch’ was first used to refer to the head of the household, family or tribe, and the roles were occupied by men. The idea of ‘patriarch’ is rooted in Biblical times whereby reference was made to the sons of Jacob, including Abraham, Isaac and their forefathers. In more recent times, the concept of patriarchy has come to represent a system or government in which the father or eldest male is head of the family. Boonzaaier and Sharp (1988), state that patriarchy is a system of domination of man over woman. It transcends different economic systems, eras, regions and class. Makama (2013) argues that all societies are gendered and that the order of the gender system determines the relationship between established gender roles. This is consistent with the notion shared by Boonzaaier and Sharp (Ibid.). The ‘ideology of patriarchy’ seems to have developed as a result of the elevation of the ‘idea of leadership of the forefathers’, to a position of paramount importance in society, and refers to the ‘once positive ideal’ of the father as the head and protector of the family (Ibid.).

Table 2: Defining ‘patriarchy’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SOURCE</th>
<th>DEFINITION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Makama (2013:117)</td>
<td>A system of male authority which oppresses women through its social, political and economic institutions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coetzee (2001)</td>
<td>Patriarchy can thus be defined as a set of social relations between men, which has a material base, and which create interdependence and solidarity amongst men that enable them to dominate women.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kevane (2004)</td>
<td>Gender refers to the constellation of rules and identities that prescribe behaviour for persons in their social roles as men and women.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cassidy &amp; Trafimow (2002:236)</td>
<td>Patriarchy is a set of beliefs that legitimates male power and authority over women in marriage or marriage-like arrangements.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Own tabulation

The World Survey (UN, 2009:8) states that ‘labour-intensive activities in the livelihood strategies for the poor include unpaid family labour, piece-rate work and own-account work in a myriad of informal small-scale trade’. Poor people are actively involved in income generation for their families. In the statistical release, the Living Conditions of Households in South Africa (LCHSA) (2008-2009) revealed that female-headed households in South Africa amounted to 43% of the
The report also revealed that due to the low educational levels among women, a comparative skills deficit exists, which is cited as part of the exclusionary mechanism of patriarchy. The LCHSA (2008-2009:5) concluded that ‘while education is an enabler, disappointingly women are not as enabled by their education status as their male counterparts. Makana (2013:5) discusses the sexual division of labour in what he terms the ‘specialised gender roles of male and female and their relations to the means of production’, as part of his analysis of the role of capital towards gender, and, ultimately, patriarchy. Coetzee (2001:300) in his earlier work argued that patriarchy ‘brutalises men and neutralises women across the colour line in South Africa’. Patriarchy has increasingly come to have a negative effect on the development and empowerment of women in modern-day societies because the economy is in itself predominantly gendered.

Economic inequality is also gendered. Women tend to have less access to land; credit, capital and high-income jobs and they disproportionately carry the brunt of caring for dependent children, the disabled and older people, which makes them more disadvantaged and more vulnerable to poverty (Moghadam, 2005:8). There is an interconnectedness that can be found in the relation of women to economic resources through an analysis of class and social culture. As observed in Moghadam (2005:2), ‘the growing visibility of women’s poverty is rooted in demographic trends and the political economy’. Moghadam (Ibid.:25) further argues that childrearing and childbearing often limits the capacity of females to reach their economic potential and, in most instances, women tend to have low levels of education... tendency to have larger number of children leave women highly vulnerable”. Kevane (2004) argues that patriarchy manifests itself in different ways and can occupy the public sphere in a myriad of ways. Privately, in the household, the control exerted by the husband as the head of the house is seen as the accepted custom and traditional way in which a man must behave. Chingono (2012:10) observed that ‘the patriarchal control of resources within the household forced women to find ways of income generating to cater for things not deemed essential by their husbands’.

In a patriarchal society there are clearly defined gender rules and roles that apply that are purely based on physical attributes. Commenting on gender-specific roles of women in Sub-Saharan Africa, Chingono (2012:119) found that women in Lesotho ‘endure a triple jeopardy of exploitation by the state, the capitalist system and traditional patriarchy’. Makama (2013:115), commenting on the

---

gender roles in Nigeria, concluded that in Nigeria it is a commonality to treat and think of women as ‘second-class citizens’. What happens in a patriarchal society is that positions or gender roles which are occupied by men and women fall under the general umbrella or ordered gender stems and these occupy every aspect in the make-up of the populace. The position of women in society, namely that of subjugation, is based on the inequality and inefficiency of justified allocation of roles while gender encompasses the allocation of roles to individuals according to sex. Patriarchy explained in these terms indicates that a system exists that has both a distinguished role of the male and female, set as parameters towards independent relations of both sexes towards one another in economic matters.

Patriarchy in a society can be an indicator of vulnerability and can confine women to numerous types of exploitation, all operating from the realm of patriarchy. The character of patriarchy is not particularly unique to specific cultures or races in South Africa as ‘both Western and African cultures seem to be deeply influenced by the idea of the supremacy of the fathers, since patriarchy is irrevocably part of both Eurocentric and Afrocentric cultures (Coetzee, 2001:300). Patriarchy, regardless of the manner in which it is constructed, always posits a stance to isolate gender roles and hegemonic relations of these genders towards each other. The reality is that women, even in their plight for economic emancipation, have to face challenges that are inherent in the dominant and sometimes oppressive nature of patriarchy. Patriarchy, like any ideology, is a belief or value widely held in societies to be morally correct for one group of people to hold dominance over another (Omofolabo, 1993:162).

Moghadam (2005:16) argues that women are subjected to more than one type of oppression. Explained, ‘double patriarchy’ refers to ‘a system under which sexism, the weapon of patriarchal power and its various manifestations politically, socially and economically oppress women twice over’. In addition to the already existing cultural patriarchy, there exists another form that performs as such in the external sphere of society outside of the family, where economics and politics meet. This is to say that opportunities for females in societies are not only dependent on internal household dynamics but are also fuelled by the lack of external dynamics in policies that seek to address inequalities of gender. The lack of available job opportunities for people with low skills and very little education leaves a lot of women vulnerable as female-headed households continue to increase (Ibid.12).
Since the constitutional democracy in 1994, South Africa has experienced illustrations of gender equality being questioned in both public and private spaces. In his judgement over cases relating to patriarchy, former Chief Justice of the Constitutional Court stated that ‘[male primogeniture] is a form of discrimination that entrenches past patterns of disadvantage among a vulnerable group, exacerbated by old notions of patriarchy and male domination incompatible with equality under the constitutional order (Langa, 2005). The challenge of patriarchy to women entrepreneurs in South Africa appears to be an ongoing phenomenon (Moghadan, 2005). The patriarchal nature of the South African society plays a role in limiting or inhibiting women in the informal economy.

---

12 Nomboniso Gasa, who was then chair of the Commission on Gender Equality, responds to Inkosi (traditional chief) Mwelo Nonkonyana of the Congress of Traditional Leaders of South Africa, by stating: ‘I can speak whenever I want to and I didn’t come here as “your woman”. We are not your women. We come as citizens of this country. We are equals’. Inkosi Mwelo Nokonyana responded in the following manner: ‘Traditions are designed to protect vulnerable women and children, not to discriminate against them. [I]n the pursuit of ... a western-inspired individualist human rights culture, we ... [should] not end up denying the vulnerable and insecure the protection which our cultures, customs and traditions avail’.

13 See Bhe & others v Khayelitsha Magistrate & others 2004 ZACC 17; 2005 1 SA 580 (CC); 2005 1 BCLR 1 (CC), Shibi v Sithole; SA Human Rights Commission v President of the RSA 2005 1 SA 580 (CC); 2005 1 BCLR 1 (CC) paragraph 91.
3. Case studies

In the first case, we share the experience of a 34-year-old woman in the pilot project. In this case we see how patriarchy misuses power to gain hegemony. The participant shared her story of being prohibited from operating her business outside her house by her partner. The big challenge that she experiences is that her partner is unemployed and that is why she does not want to disobey his orders. It is important to her that he does not feel emasculated in the house because she is the only one bringing in an income. The state-provided social grant (cash transfer) Child Support Grant (CSG) forms an important source of income in the household, apart from the money she makes from the hair salon. She states that her partner has in the past accused her of wanting to be the ‘man’ of the house. From her statement an argument ensued, which resulted in him setting their two-roomed house on fire. In the fire she lost many of her personal belongings, including furniture. She states that since she started operating her hair-salon business from her house she hasn’t been getting as many customers as before because clients do not want to come to her house as they fear her partner.

The dominating role that her partner has over her has also negatively influenced and affected the relationships that she used to have with her friends. These are friends whom she relied on during hard times, especially for financial assistance. Her friendships have since ceased after the partner isolated her from all of them. She was also forced to stop participating in a stokvel that was formed with other women who operate enterprises in the area. Rolfe et al. (2010) reflect how in South Africa stokvels have been used by women to start their own informal ventures. More importantly, stokvels are used as a source of credit in times of financial need (Rolfe et al., 2010). The participant

---

14 Each of the four participants whose case studies are set out in this section gave informed consent to us using their stories on condition of having their names withheld.

15 The Child Support Grant (CSG) is a means-tested government accessed financial allowance given to a child’s caregiver. The grant is R310 and paid monthly through the South African Social Security Agency (SASSA) at paypoints or electronic deposit into a bank account as part of the constitutionally enshrined right to social security found in Section 27 of the South African Constitution.

16 A stokvel is a traditional community savings club of people contributing fixed or agreed sums of money over a set period of time, or a contribution of sums of money on a rotating basis among the agreed members (FinScope South Africa, 2014).
states that not being part of a stokvel means that she can no longer access credit when she is in financial trouble. She does not have a bank account, which means she cannot access credit from formal financial-sector services. One of the challenges that deplete her ability to save is that her partner constantly runs into problems with law enforcement agencies, and he requires her to raise money for bail.

The pilot project is built around five interventions, with one of them being the regular mentoring and monitoring by fieldworkers. During one of the field visits by the fieldworker (referred to as an ‘enterprise coach’ in the project), she states that her partner insisted that he should be allowed to come to the workshops or else she would not be allowed to attend. The enterprise coaches have also been noting that he controls her movements.

Lastly, she states that because she has been forced to relocate her business, this has resulted in reduced profits from her business. As a result, her four-year-old son has not been attending an Early Childhood Development (ECD) Centre because she cannot afford to pay the fees. The money received from the CSG is used to pay for other households needs. She continues to cohabit with her partner in a rented room which she pays for despite him setting fire to their two-roomed house before.

‘Ke ne ke kopa hore ke tle diworkshopong le motho waka, hobane ore o batla ho bona hore ho etsuwa eng moo’. Translation: ‘I need to ask you to allow me to bring my partner to the next set of workshops as he insists that he wants to know what we do there.’

---

17 Five interventions form part of the project methodology, namely (1) Life Skills Training, (2) Financial Literacy Training, (3) Basic Business Management Skills Training, (4) Savings Incentive Scheme, (5) Weekly mentoring and monitoring by fieldworkers.

18 Life Skills Training, Basic Financial Literacy Training and Basic Business Management Skills Training all present workshops which participants are invited to attend. The lessons from the workshops are reinforced during the weekly visits by field workers.
Case Study 2

In the second case, the project participant was able to attend all the project workshops, and with the assistance of the enterprise coach she has been working on a business plan that will assist her in expanding her business. She stated that due to her newly acquired skills from the workshops and regular assistance from enterprise coaches, her partner has become jealous because she doesn’t need his assistance. During one of the weekly visit by the enterprise coach, she advised her coach that she could no longer participate in the project since, given that her partner is the one who provided her with the start-up capital, he should be the one who attends the workshops and receives the weekly visits.

According to the partner, he should be the participant as he will be better able to understand business concepts as she is uneducated and so would not be able to understand. Below is a direct quote from the conversation with the enterprise coach.

“They think I should be part of the project because I am a man and I am educated. This lady did not finish school.”

The partner is also convinced that he should be the one who participates in the programme moving forward as he is the one who provided the start-up capital for the business. This assertion highlights the patriarchal view that women do not need to be educated or empowered – this is seen as the duty and role of men in society. Patriarchy by its nature uses norms and various manipulations to normalise the dominance of males in society.

One of the issues that have made things worse for the project participant is that she also has health problems, and this makes it hard for her to operate her business on a regular basis. During this time, she also lost her twins. Her partner tried to run the business, alongside his formal employment at a fast-food outlet in Vereeniging. The designated enterprise coach also noticed that the business was

---

19 Vereeniging is a city situated in the southern part of Gauteng, and its neighbours are Vanderbijlpark (to the west), Three Rivers (east), Meyerton (north) and Sasolburg (south).
almost shut down due to the competing time constraints of the partner. The enterprise coach most recently could not locate the participant as her partner has apparently sent her to Sharpeville, which is where her parents are, because he feels that as a man he lacks the capacity to look after a sick person.

Translated to English: 'I sent her to Sharpeville to her mother because she got too sick for me to take care of her. As a man, I am unable to take care of a sick person like that.
In the third case we share the life of a 47-year-old woman. Many women are subjected to controlled financial situations by the men in their lives, whether they are their husbands, live-in partners, or simply boyfriends (Cassidy & Trafimow, 2002). In this case, the woman states that she is forced to hide her income from her partner for fear that he would want to take it and control how she uses it. She states that she does not tell him about the stokvels that she is involved in because she is scared that he would control how the proceeds should be spent. She does the same with the profits from her hair-salon business. What we have found is that this is the case with many women in the project as they state that they do not disclose to their partner or husband the money they receive from stokvels out of the fear that they might take it away from them. Coetzee (2001) argues that through internalisation, these structures of domination are kept intact. The participant accepts the control of the partner, as she expresses that this has to be the case since he is the man in her life.
In the fourth case we share the story of participant no 66 who originally started her business selling skirts at the paypoint of the South African Social Security (SASSA) in Evaton. In a conversation with the designated fieldworker, she speaks about how the interventions from the project, especially the financial literacy aspect, have taught her the importance of saving. Through her savings she is now also selling fast food to supplement her income. This expansion has caused her partner to start taking an interest in her business because of increased profits.

Her partner now works with her full time in the fast food business; she is happy about him assisting in generating income for the household. However, she is not happy that he is also heavily engaged now in the financial management of the business profits. Prior to joining her in her fast-food business, her partner used to wash taxis in Vereeniging for income. She would have liked to invest her increased profits in a stokvel so that she can be able to send money to her mother in the Free State, but her partner forbids her from doing that. This type of experience was captured by Horn (1991:28), who argued that ‘although patriarchy is much older than capitalism, modern patriarchal domination is now reinforced by the relationship of exploitation central to the capitalist mode of production’. This means that male domination in the household is linked to incomes, whether brought and out under the control of the man, despite women’s disapproval of this. The participant continues to send money to her mother in the Free State without the partner knowing.

‘Ndite wa haka o hana ha ke isa ngwana sebakeng sa thokomelo ya bana, hobane are o sa le monyane. Sena se etsa hore ke seke ka kgona hoya rekisa De Deur kapa ho tsamaya dibakeng tse ding tsa thekiso’. Translation: ‘My husband refuses for me to take my child to the day care, because he says she is too young. This has caused me to be unable to go to De Deur or other places of business.’
In the fifth case we share the experiences of Participant no. 48, a woman who runs a blanket stall outside the SASSA paypoint in Evaton. She speaks about how her children are preventing her from reaching her full business potential. She argues that since she has six children, with the youngest one being a year old, she unable to conduct her business to her full potential and at a competitive level with her counterparts selling the same product. The competitive advantage derives from the ability to be mobile, meaning that she can go to different sections of the township to sell her products. She stated to her enterprise coach that her business had slowed down, especially at the SASSA pay point and that she needed to be mobile if she was to remain competitive and profitable – and with the little baby she is not able to do this. Before she gave birth to her last baby, she was able to sell in an area outside the township (De Deur), but because of household duties such as laundry and cleaning the house she is unable to do so now. Her one–year-old baby does not go to an ECD because her husband says that she is too young to be in the care of other people.

She adds that she now relies heavily on the assistance of her husband to supplement household income, and this does not make the husband happy as he has other wives to look after too. She hopes to convince him to allow her to enrol the baby in a day-care facility so that she is able to increase her income by being able to be mobile and reach wider markets.

Project participant is in a polygamist marriage. She is the last wife out five wives.
Patriarchy in society sometimes plays out in different ways, and sometimes not in explicit forms. For example, in our sixth case, the participant, an owner of a shebeen located in Evaton, expresses her grievances over her financial challenges. She says that she has a daughter who also has her own child and both of them depend on her income for survival. The problem she has is that her daughter has not registered her child with SASSA in order to benefit from the social assistance programme, the CSG provided by the government. She says that her daughter did not register her child because the father of the child doesn’t want her to do that. The father of the child argues that he doesn’t want his child on the CSG because of the stigma around the CSG in the township. He feels that as a man he would be seen incapable of taking care of his own child. She expresses her concerns in this manner around the stigma of the CSG:

‘Ha o kgola tjhelete ya mmuso ya bana, batho ba re o kgola tjhelete ya letheka. Sena se etsa hore banna ba bangata, haholoholo ba sa leng dilemong tse tlase ba thibele basadi ho ngodisetsa bana ba bona’. Translation: ‘When you receive the CSG, people say that you are being paid for using your waist (having sexual intercourse), and this is the same reason a lot of young men refuse for women to register their children.

She adds that despite countless discussions with the boyfriend, he continues to refuse for the child to be registered for the CSG. This is despite the fact that he is unemployed and he has limited avenues of generating income. She uses some of the profits from her shebeen business to pay for her grandson’s day-care fees. Her daughter refuses to register for the CSG without the boyfriend’s approval, and therefore it is up to the participant to meet the family’s financial needs. This makes things difficult in the house as she also has other children who are still at school and whom she has to take care of.
In our last case we share the story of project participant no. 89 who also owns a shebeen and also operates as a loan shark (informal money lender) to neighbours, friends and family members. She says that loan sharks are common in that area, but her problem is that male customers refuse to pay her because they don’t see her as a threat. She says the reason they do not see her as a threat is because other loan shark businesses operated by men in the area often use violence and intimidation to deal with non-payments from male customers. She says that when she needs to confront a non-paying customer she has to ask her brother to accompany her.

The continued non-payment from male customers has dealt her a financial blow as she now runs at a loss. She says her brother has since advised her to stop the business or let him run it for her. She does not, however, agree with handing the business over to her brother as she fears he will not return the money to her, and she wouldn’t be able to show resistance against him.
4. Analysis of case studies

Patriarchy is defined as a system of social relations whereby men dominate women, and deals with legitimised power by men over women (Boonzaaier & Sharp, 1988; Coetzee, 2004; Kevane, 2004; Cassidy & Trafimow, 2002; Makama, 2013). The paper sought to explore patriarchy and how it manifests itself in the seven case studies. The results from the seven case studies indicate that patriarchy exists amongst the case studies explored. In fact, the way that research respondents were able to reflect at a personal level how they experience patriarchy in their lives is consistent with the literature reviewed (Boonzaaier & Sharp, 1988; Coetzee, 2004; Kevane, 2004; Cassidy & Trafimow, 2002; Makama, 2013).

In the statement below, participant no. 133 discusses how patriarchy manifests itself, by explaining how her partner sees her role, economically and socially, within the household. This statement is consistent with the notion shared by Boozaiier and Sharp (1988) and Makama (2013) who argue that societies are gendered and that there is a relationship between gender and means of production in society.

The notion that fathers are the protectors of the family and women are the caregivers is rooted in the ‘ideology of patriarchy’, as explained by Boonzaaier and Sharp (1998) who review the ‘once positive ideal’ of the father as the head and protector of the family. In the statement below we see how a woman is expected to look after the baby, even though she is an important economic player within the household. Her husband would prefer her to earn less income and perform her ‘expected’ gendered role of a woman. Omofalabo (1993) argued that there also exists double patriarchy, which is explained as ‘a system under which sexism, the weapon of patriarchal power and its various manifestations, politically, socially and economically oppress women twice over’. In the statement below we see how a woman is oppressed twice over as womanhood is used to subject her to child-minding, which oppresses her economic potential.
Moghadam (2005) argues that childrearing and childbearing often limit the capacity of females to reach their economic potential and in most instances women tend to have low levels of education. The traditional view that women are the primary caregivers in families still continues to this day (Chingono, 2012). Gender roles define who takes care of the sick and who doesn’t, and this is a good lens through which to look at patriarchy (Chingono, 1999).

More importantly, in this research, respondents were able to reflect on some of the challenges they experience at a personal level and some of the difficulties they experience due to patriarchy and dominant male figures in the household. The nature of the relationship between project participants with their partners was not explained and understood as patriarchal in nature by project participants. However, it was consistent with the literature explored according to which it captures patriarchy as gendered and entrenched in social, political and economic interactions in society.

Kevane (2004) argues that patriarchy manifests itself in different ways and can occupy the public sphere in a myriad of ways. Privately, in the household, the control exerted by the husband as the head of the house is seen as the accepted custom and traditional way in which a man must behave.
The statement above is consistent with the notion shared by Chingono (2012) with regard to patriarchal control of resources. He observed that within households women were forced to cater for things that the husband deemed not essential. This further highlights the social expectation and gendered relations alluded to by Makama (2013) with regard to means of production.

The pilot project has 300 project participants, with 150 in the treatment and 150 in the control group. Some of the issues that the project had to deal with, as reflected by the challenges experienced by enterprise coaches/fieldworkers during the course of the project, is how patriarchy manifests itself. Female enterprise coaches experience untoward approaches from male project participants. After several reports from female fieldworkers, the project was forced to designate enterprise coaches to match the gender of the project participant. In some cases, what we have also found is that the older generation (between 40-60 years old) of male project participants prefer to have male fieldworkers/enterprise coaches for the weekly visits because they feel that women are not qualified to speak to them about business. Below is a quote from a male participant to a female enterprise coach.

Ke beha tjheletenyana ka thooko, hore bana baka ba tsebe ho thola tjhelete ya dijo sekoolong, ka ha ntate wa bona a ba rekela dijo le diaparo tsa sekoolo feela. Le tjheleteng ya ka ya kgwebo ha a ba nehe. Translation: ‘I put some of my profits on the side to give my kids lunch money when they go to school. You see I have to do this because my husband only buys food and school uniforms and will not give them lunch money, even from the profits I give him from the business’ (Participant no. 8)

The treatment group receives the five interventions (please visit www.spii.org.za for full description of the interventions).

The control groups share the same characteristics with the treatment group but do not receive the five interventions. A baseline study was conducted on both the treatment and control groups.

There are four fieldworkers for the treatment group, of whom three are female and one male.
The data gathered in this paper is consistent with the literature explored on patriarchy. Furthermore, most of the project participants operate in the informal economy, and the data collected through the multiple case studies is also consistent with the literature explored on the informal economy and gendered roles (Makama, 2013). What we also found in the project is that most of the female project participants are undertaking less profitable enterprises such as street trading, and this is consistent with the report by LCHSA (2009) which revealed that due to low educational levels among women, a comparative skills deficit exists. This means that women are involved in less profitable income-generating activities in the informal economy, which is often cited as part of the exclusionary mechanism of patriarchy. Valodia (2000:5) captures this continuum of patriarchy in the informal economy by asserting that ‘often when activities undertaken by women in the informal economy start to become more profitable they are gradually taken over by men’.

*Nna nkeke ka bua dintho tsa kgwebo le basadi. Basadi ha ba tsebe letho ka kgwebo.*

**Translation:** ‘I will not speak to women about business-related issues, that is, women know nothing about business.’
5. **Conclusion and recommendations**

A case study approach is more than simply conducting research on a single individual or situation. This approach has the potential to deal with simple through complex situations. It enables the researcher to answer ‘how’ and ‘why’ type questions, while taking into consideration how a phenomenon is influenced by the context within which it is situated. Despite the constitutional democracy achieved in 1994, which promotes and protects equality among all, what the paper has been able to find through the case studies is that ‘patriarchal norms’, as defined in the literature, exists and characterises the female project participants who formed part of the study.

**Recommendations (as discussed above)**

- The gender development dialogue has not taken policy and practical solutions for women empowerment beyond discussion. It is time that a policy is designed to empower women in practical ways to have greater autonomy over their financial and economic endeavours.
- Programmes such as this pilot, which tend to have greater participation by women should encourage and cater for the involvement of project participants’ partners/husband and fathers to deal with the notion of patriarchy as part of the transformation agenda.
- Better access to affordable and developmental childcare facilities is essential.
- Better access to affordable micro-credit for women could create resilient livelihoods for women in the informal economy.
- Easier entry to markets and opportunities for livelihood diversification for women is one way of forging pathways for women to compete in the economy, together with deliberate attempts to include women in small-scale manufacturing. The reason is that more women are involved in trade while fewer women are found in the manufacturing sector which generally is more lucrative and capable of building up larger enterprises and creating more jobs.
- Small, Medium and Micro Enterprises (SMME) and LED strategies that aim to develop township economies need to be cognisant of the role of gender and patriarchy within society, and that there is a need for greater coordination of programmes geared at empowering women.
- Partnerships with Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) and other Community Based Organisations (CBOs) that deal with the empowerment of women are imperative for policy
development in order to address gender disparities and, ultimately, for dismantling patriarchy.

- Education and training programmes on technical skills should have a component that focuses on gender role transformation and education in order to prevent the perpetuation of patriarchal oppression and gender discrimination.
6. Bibliography


